

# HOUSE BILL NO. 4630

May 23, 2023, Introduced by Reps. Lightner, Hope, Wilson, Tsernoglou, Paiz, Morse, Pohutsky, Miller, Byrnes, Young, Rheingans, Wegela, Dievendorf, Hood, Grant, O'Neal, Breen, Price, Brixie, Tyrone Carter, Hoskins, Morgan, MacDonell, Edwards, Brenda Carter, Arbit, Brabec, Glanville, McKinney, Scott, Conlin and Aiyash and referred to the Committee on Criminal Justice.

A bill to amend 2013 PA 93, entitled "Michigan indigent defense commission act," by amending the title and sections 3, 5, 7, 9, 11, 13, 15, 17, 21, and 23 (MCL 780.983, 780.985, 780.987, 780.989, 780.991, 780.993, 780.995, 780.997, 780.1001, and 780.1003), section 3 as amended by 2019 PA 108, sections 5, 9, 11, 13, 15, and 17 as amended by 2018 PA 214, and section 7 as amended by 2018 PA 443.

**THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF MICHIGAN ENACT:**

**1** TITLE  
**2** An act to create the Michigan indigent defense commission and

1 to provide for its powers and duties; to provide **certain** indigent  
2 defendants in criminal **and juvenile** cases with effective assistance  
3 of counsel; to provide standards for the appointment of legal  
4 counsel; to provide for and limit certain causes of action; and to  
5 provide for certain appropriations and grants.

6 Sec. 3. As used in this act:

7 (a) "Adult" means either of the following:

8 (i) An individual 18 years of age or older.

9 (ii) An individual less than 18 years of age at the time of the  
10 commission of a felony if any of the following conditions apply:

11 (A) During consideration of a petition filed under section 4  
12 of chapter XIIA of the probate code of 1939, 1939 PA 288, MCL  
13 712A.4, to waive jurisdiction to try the individual as an adult and  
14 upon granting a waiver of jurisdiction.

15 (B) The prosecuting attorney designates the case under section  
16 2d(1) of chapter XIIA of the probate code of 1939, 1939 PA 288, MCL  
17 712A.2d, as a case in which the juvenile is to be tried in the same  
18 manner as an adult.

19 (C) During consideration of a request by the prosecuting  
20 attorney under section 2d(2) of chapter XIIA of the probate code of  
21 1939, 1939 PA 288, MCL 712A.2d, that the court designate the case  
22 as a case in which the juvenile is to be tried in the same manner  
23 as an adult.

24 (D) The prosecuting attorney authorizes the filing of a  
25 complaint and warrant for a specified juvenile violation under  
26 section 1f of chapter IV of the code of criminal procedure, 1927 PA  
27 175, MCL 764.1f.

28 (b) "Consumer Price Index" means the annual United States  
29 Consumer Price Index for all urban consumers as defined and

1 reported by the United States Department of Labor, Bureau of Labor  
2 Statistics.

3 (c) "Department" means the department of licensing and  
4 regulatory affairs.

5 (d) "Effective assistance of counsel" or "effective  
6 representation" means legal representation that is compliant with  
7 standards established by the appellate courts of this state and the  
8 United States Supreme Court.

9 (e) "Indigent" means ~~meeting 1 or more of the conditions~~  
10 ~~described in section 11(3).~~ **an inability to obtain competent legal**  
11 **representation for one's self without substantial financial**  
12 **hardship to one's self or one's dependents, as determined using the**  
13 **standards and procedures prescribed by MIDC under section 11.**

14 (f) "Indigent ~~criminal~~-defense services" means local legal  
15 defense services provided to a ~~defendant and to which both of the~~  
16 ~~following conditions apply:~~ **any of the following individuals:**

17 (i) ~~The defendant~~ **An indigent adult who** is being prosecuted or  
18 sentenced for a crime for which ~~an individual~~ **the adult** may be  
19 imprisoned upon conviction, beginning ~~with~~ **not later than** the  
20 ~~defendant's~~ **adult's** initial appearance in court to answer to the  
21 criminal charge.

22 (ii) ~~The defendant is determined to be indigent under section~~  
23 ~~11(3).~~

24 (ii) **An indigent youth who is, or is alleged to be, under the**  
25 **jurisdiction of the court under section 2(a), (d), or (h) of**  
26 **chapter XIIIA of the probate code of 1939, 1939 PA 288, MCL 712A.2,**  
27 **beginning not later than the youth's preliminary inquiry.**

28 (g) Indigent ~~criminal~~-defense services do not include ~~services~~  
29 ~~authorized to be~~ **any of the following:**

1 (i) **Services** provided under the appellate defender act, 1978 PA  
2 620, MCL 780.711 to 780.719.

3 (ii) **Services provided by a lawyer-guardian ad litem under**  
4 **section 17c(7) to (10) and section 17d of chapter XIIIA of the**  
5 **probate code of 1939, 1939 PA 288, MCL 712A.17c and 712A.17d.**

6 (h) "Indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense system" or "~~system~~" means  
7 either of the following:

8 (i) The local unit of government that funds a trial court.

9 (ii) If a trial court is funded by more than 1 local unit of  
10 government, those local units of government, collectively.

11 (i) "Local share" or "share" means an indigent ~~eriminal~~  
12 defense system's average annual expenditure for indigent ~~eriminal~~  
13 **adult** defense services in the 3 fiscal years immediately preceding  
14 the creation of the MIDC under this act ~~, excluding money~~  
15 ~~reimbursed to the system by individuals determined to be partially~~  
16 ~~indigent.~~ **and indigent youth defense services in the 3 fiscal years**  
17 **immediately preceding January 1, 2024.** Beginning on November 1,  
18 2018, if the Consumer Price Index has increased since November 1 of  
19 the prior state fiscal year, the local share must be adjusted **and**  
20 **compounded annually** by that number or by 3%, whichever is less.

21 (j) "MIDC" or "commission" means the Michigan indigent defense  
22 commission ~~created~~ **established** under section 5.

23 (k) "Partially indigent" means a ~~eriminal~~-defendant who is  
24 unable to afford the complete cost of legal representation, but is  
25 able to contribute a monetary amount toward ~~his or her~~ **the**  
26 representation.

27 (l) "Youth" means an individual who is less than 18 years of  
28 age and who is the subject of a delinquency petition.

29 Sec. 5. (1) The Michigan indigent defense commission is

1 established within the department.

2 (2) The MIDC is an autonomous entity within the department.  
 3 Except as otherwise provided by law, the MIDC shall exercise its  
 4 statutory powers, duties, functions, and responsibilities  
 5 independently of the department. The department shall provide  
 6 support and coordinated services as requested by the MIDC including  
 7 providing personnel, budgeting, procurement, and other  
 8 administrative support to the MIDC sufficient to carry out its  
 9 duties, powers, and responsibilities.

10 (3) The MIDC shall propose minimum standards for the local  
 11 delivery of indigent ~~criminal~~-defense services providing effective  
 12 assistance of counsel to adults **and youth** throughout this state.  
 13 ~~These~~

14 (4) **The** minimum standards must be designed to ensure the  
 15 provision of indigent ~~criminal~~-defense services that meet  
 16 constitutional requirements for effective assistance of counsel.  
 17 However, these minimum standards must not infringe on the supreme  
 18 court's authority over practice and procedure in the courts of this  
 19 state as set forth in section 5 of article VI of the state  
 20 constitution of 1963.

21 (5) ~~(4)~~The commission shall convene a public hearing before a  
 22 proposed **minimum** standard is recommended to the department.

23 (6) A **proposed** minimum standard ~~proposed under this subsection~~  
 24 must be submitted to the department for approval or rejection.  
 25 ~~Opposition~~

26 (7) **Any opposition** to a proposed minimum standard may be  
 27 submitted to the department in a manner prescribed by the  
 28 department. ~~An~~**If an** indigent ~~criminal~~-defense system ~~that~~ objects  
 29 to a ~~recommended~~**proposed** minimum standard on the ground that the

1 ~~recommended~~**proposed** minimum standard would exceed the MIDC's  
 2 statutory authority, ~~shall~~**the objection must** state specifically  
 3 how the ~~recommended~~**proposed** minimum standard would exceed the  
 4 MIDC's statutory authority. A

5 (8) **Except as otherwise provided in subsection (9), a proposed**  
 6 minimum standard is final when it is approved by the department. A

7 (9) **The commission may amend an approved minimum standard at**  
 8 **any time in accordance with the procedures set forth in subsections**  
 9 **(5) to (8). If a proposed minimum standard has been recommended to**  
 10 **the department but not yet approved or rejected, the commission may**  
 11 **modify the proposed minimum standard. If the commission modifies**  
 12 **the proposed minimum standard under this subsection, the commission**  
 13 **must again convene a public hearing before recommending the**  
 14 **modified proposed minimum standard to the department.**

15 (10) **An approved** minimum standard ~~that is approved by the~~  
 16 ~~department~~ is not subject to challenge through the appellate  
 17 procedures in section 15.

18 (11) An approved minimum standard for the local delivery of  
 19 indigent ~~criminal~~-defense services within an indigent ~~criminal~~  
 20 defense system is not a rule as that term is defined in section 7  
 21 of the administrative procedures act of 1969, 1969 PA 306, MCL  
 22 24.207.

23 (12) ~~(5) Approval~~**An approval** of a minimum standard proposed  
 24 by the MIDC is considered a final department action subject to  
 25 judicial review under section 28 of article VI of the state  
 26 constitution of 1963 to determine whether the approved minimum  
 27 standard is authorized by law. ~~Jurisdiction~~

28 (13) **The jurisdiction** and venue for **the** judicial review **of an**  
 29 **approved minimum standard** are vested in the court of claims.

1           **(14)** An indigent ~~criminal~~-defense system may file a petition  
2 for **the review of an approved minimum standard** in the court of  
3 claims within 60 days after the date of mailing **or emailing** notice  
4 of the department's final decision on the ~~recommended~~-**proposed**  
5 minimum standard.

6           **(15)** The filing of a petition for review **under subsection (14)**  
7 does not stay enforcement of an approved minimum standard, but the  
8 department may grant, or the court of claims may order, a stay upon  
9 appropriate terms.

10           **(16)** ~~(6)~~-The MIDC shall identify and encourage best practices  
11 for delivering the effective assistance of counsel to indigent  
12 defendants. ~~charged with crimes.~~

13           **(17)** ~~(7)~~-The MIDC shall identify and implement a system of  
14 performance metrics to assess the provision of indigent defense  
15 services in this state relative to national standards and  
16 benchmarks.

17           **(18)** The MIDC shall provide an annual report to the governor,  
18 **the** legislature, **the** supreme court, and the state budget director  
19 on the performance metrics not later than December 15 of each year.

20           Sec. 7. (1) The MIDC includes ~~18-19~~ voting members and the ex  
21 officio member described in subsection ~~(2)~~-**(4)**.

22           **(2)** ~~The~~-**Except as otherwise provided in subsection (11), the**  
23 ~~18-19~~ voting members ~~shall~~-**must** be appointed by the governor for  
24 terms of 4 years. ~~, except as provided in subsection (4).~~

25           **(3)** Subject to ~~subsection (3)~~, **subsections (5) to (9)**, the  
26 governor shall appoint **the 19** members ~~under this~~-**described in**  
27 subsection **(1)** as follows:

28           (a) Two members submitted by the speaker of the house of  
29 representatives.

1 (b) Two members submitted by the senate majority leader.

2 (c) One member from a list of 3 names submitted by the supreme  
3 court chief justice.

4 (d) Three members from a list of 9 names submitted by the  
5 Criminal Defense Attorneys of Michigan.

6 **(e) One member from a list of 3 names submitted by the**  
7 **children's law section of the State Bar of Michigan who is**  
8 **experienced in defending youth in delinquency proceedings.**

9 (f) ~~(e)~~—One member from a list of 3 names submitted by the  
10 Michigan Judges Association.

11 (g) ~~(f)~~—One member from a list of 3 names submitted by the  
12 Michigan District Judges Association.

13 (h) ~~(g)~~—One member from a list of 3 names submitted by the  
14 State Bar of Michigan.

15 (i) ~~(h)~~—One member from a list of names submitted by bar  
16 associations whose primary mission or purpose is to advocate for  
17 minority interests. Each bar association described in this  
18 subdivision may submit 1 name.

19 (j) ~~(i)~~—One member from a list of 3 names submitted by the  
20 Prosecuting Attorneys Association of Michigan who is a former  
21 county prosecuting attorney or former assistant county prosecuting  
22 attorney.

23 (k) ~~(j)~~—One member selected to represent the general public.

24 (l) ~~(k)~~—Two members representing the funding unit of a circuit  
25 court from a list of 6 names submitted by the Michigan Association  
26 of Counties.

27 (m) ~~(l)~~—One member representing the funding unit of a district  
28 court from a list of 3 names submitted by the Michigan Townships  
29 Association or the Michigan Municipal League. The Michigan

1 Townships Association and the Michigan Municipal League shall  
 2 alternate in submitting a list as described under this subdivision.  
 3 For the first appointment after ~~the effective date of the~~  
 4 ~~amendatory act that amended this subdivision,~~ **March 21, 2019,** the  
 5 Michigan Municipal League shall submit a list as described under  
 6 this subdivision for consideration for the appointment. For the  
 7 second appointment after ~~the effective date of the amendatory act~~  
 8 ~~that amended this subdivision,~~ **March 21, 2019,** the Michigan  
 9 Townships Association shall submit a list as described under this  
 10 subdivision for consideration for the appointment.

11 (n) ~~(m)~~ One member from a list of 3 names submitted by the  
 12 state budget office.

13 (4) ~~(2)~~ The supreme court chief justice or ~~his or her~~ **the**  
 14 designee **of the chief justice** shall serve as an ex officio member  
 15 of the MIDC without vote.

16 (5) ~~(3) Individuals~~ **Every individual** nominated for service on  
 17 the MIDC as provided in subsection ~~(1)~~ **(3)** must have **at least 1 of**  
 18 **the following:**

19 (a) ~~significant~~ **Significant** experience in the defense or  
 20 prosecution of criminal proceedings. ~~or have~~

21 (b) **Significant experience in the defense or prosecution of**  
 22 **youth in juvenile proceedings.**

23 (c) ~~demonstrated a~~ **A strong and demonstrated** commitment to  
 24 providing effective representation in indigent ~~criminal~~ defense  
 25 services.

26 (6) Of the members appointed under this section, the governor  
 27 shall appoint no fewer than 2 individuals who are ~~not~~ licensed  
 28 attorneys **and at least 1 individual with substantial knowledge of**  
 29 **the juvenile justice system.**

1           (7) Any individual who receives compensation from this state  
2 or an indigent ~~criminal~~-defense system for providing prosecution of  
3 or representation to indigent adults **or youth** in state courts is  
4 ineligible to serve as a member of the MIDC.

5           (8) Not more than 3 judges, whether they are former judges or  
6 sitting judges, shall serve on the MIDC at the same time.

7           (9) The governor may reject the names submitted under  
8 subsection ~~(1)~~-(3) and request additional names.

9           (10) ~~(4)~~-**An** MIDC ~~members~~-**member** shall hold office until ~~their~~  
10 ~~successors are~~-**a successor is** appointed **for the member**.

11           (11) The terms of the members must be staggered. Initially, 4  
12 members must be appointed for a term of 4 years each, 4 members  
13 must be appointed for a term of 3 years each, 4 members must be  
14 appointed for a term of 2 years each, and 3 members must be  
15 appointed for a term of 1 year each.

16           (12) ~~(5)~~-The governor shall fill a vacancy occurring in the  
17 membership of the MIDC in the same manner as the original  
18 appointment, except if the vacancy is for an appointment described  
19 in subsection ~~(1)(d)~~,-(3) (d), the source of the nomination shall  
20 submit a list of 3 names for each vacancy. However, if the senate  
21 majority leader or the speaker of the house of representatives is  
22 the source of the nomination, 1 name must be submitted. If an MIDC  
23 member vacates the commission before the end of the member's term,  
24 the governor shall fill that vacancy for the unexpired term only.

25           (13) ~~(6)~~ The governor shall appoint 1 of the original MIDC  
26 members to serve as chairperson of the MIDC for a term of 1 year.  
27 ~~At the expiration of that year, or upon the vacancy in the~~  
28 ~~membership of the member appointed chairperson, the~~**The** MIDC shall  
29 annually elect a chairperson from its membership to serve a 1-year

1 term. An MIDC member shall not serve as chairperson of the MIDC for  
2 more than 3 consecutive terms.

3 (14) ~~(7)~~—MIDC members shall not receive compensation in that  
4 capacity but must be reimbursed for their reasonable actual and  
5 necessary expenses by the state treasurer.

6 (15) ~~(8)~~—The governor may remove an MIDC member for  
7 incompetence, dereliction of duty, malfeasance, misfeasance, or  
8 nonfeasance in office, or for any other good cause.

9 (16) ~~(9)~~—A majority of the MIDC voting members constitute a  
10 quorum for the transaction of business at a meeting of the MIDC. A  
11 majority of the MIDC voting members are required for official  
12 action of the commission.

13 (17) ~~(10)~~—Confidential case information ~~is~~ including, but not  
14 limited to, client information and attorney work product ~~is~~  
15 exempt from disclosure under the freedom of information act, 1976  
16 PA 442, MCL 15.231 to 15.246.

17 Sec. 9. (1) The MIDC has the following authority and duties:

18 (a) Developing and overseeing the implementation, enforcement,  
19 and modification of minimum standards, rules, and procedures to  
20 ensure that indigent ~~criminal~~ defense services providing effective  
21 assistance of counsel are consistently delivered to all indigent  
22 adults **and youth** in this state consistent with the safeguards of  
23 the United States ~~constitution,~~ **Constitution**, the state  
24 constitution of 1963, and this act.

25 (b) Investigating, auditing, and reviewing the operation of  
26 indigent ~~criminal~~ defense services to ~~assure~~ **ensure** compliance with  
27 the commission's minimum standards, rules, and procedures. However,  
28 an indigent ~~criminal~~ defense service that is in compliance with the  
29 commission's minimum standards, rules, and procedures must not be

1 required to provide indigent ~~criminal~~-defense services in excess of  
2 those standards, rules, and procedures.

3 (c) Hiring an executive director and determining the  
4 appropriate number of staff needed to accomplish the purpose of the  
5 MIDC consistent with annual appropriations.

6 (d) Assigning the executive director the following duties:

7 (i) Establishing an organizational chart, preparing an annual  
8 budget, and hiring, disciplining, and firing staff.

9 (ii) Assisting the MIDC in developing, implementing, and  
10 regularly reviewing the MIDC's standards, rules, and procedures,  
11 including, but not limited to, recommending to the MIDC suggested  
12 changes to the criteria for an indigent adult's **or youth's**  
13 eligibility for receiving ~~criminal~~-trial defense services under  
14 this act.

15 (e) Establishing procedures for the receipt and resolution of  
16 complaints, and the implementation of recommendations from the  
17 courts, other participants in the criminal **and juvenile** justice  
18 ~~system,~~**systems,** clients, and members of the public.

19 (f) Establishing procedures for the mandatory collection of  
20 data concerning the operation of the MIDC, each indigent ~~criminal~~  
21 defense system, and the operation of indigent ~~criminal~~-defense  
22 services.

23 (g) Establishing rules and procedures for indigent ~~criminal~~  
24 defense systems to apply to the MIDC for grants to bring the  
25 system's delivery of indigent ~~criminal~~-defense services into  
26 compliance with the minimum standards established by the MIDC.

27 (h) Establishing procedures for annually reporting to the  
28 governor, **the** legislature, and **the** supreme court. The report  
29 required under this subdivision ~~shall~~**must** include, but **is** not ~~be~~

1 limited to, recommendations for improvements and further  
2 legislative action.

3 (2) Upon the appropriation of sufficient funds, the MIDC shall  
4 establish minimum standards to carry out the purpose of this act,  
5 and collect data from all indigent ~~criminal~~-defense systems. The  
6 MIDC shall propose goals for compliance with the minimum standards  
7 established under this act consistent with the metrics established  
8 under this section and appropriations by this state.

9 (3) In establishing and overseeing the minimum standards,  
10 rules, and procedures described in subsection (1), the MIDC shall  
11 emphasize the importance of indigent ~~criminal~~-**all of the following:**

12 (a) **Indigent** defense services provided to ~~juveniles~~-**youth**  
13 under the age of ~~17~~-**18** who are tried in the same manner as adults  
14 or who may be sentenced in the same manner as adults. ~~and to~~

15 (b) **Indigent defense services provided to** adults with mental  
16 impairments.

17 (4) The MIDC shall be mindful that defense attorneys who  
18 provide indigent ~~criminal~~-defense services are partners with the  
19 prosecution, law enforcement, and the judiciary in the criminal **and**  
20 **juvenile** justice ~~system~~-**systems**.

21 (5) The MIDC shall establish procedures for the conduct of its  
22 affairs and promulgate policies necessary to carry out its powers  
23 and duties under this act.

24 (6) **The** MIDC policies must be placed in an appropriate manual,  
25 made publicly available on a website, and made available to all  
26 attorneys and professionals providing indigent ~~criminal~~-defense  
27 services, the supreme court, the governor, the senate majority  
28 leader, the speaker of the house of representatives, the senate and  
29 house appropriations committees, and the senate and house fiscal

1 agencies.

2       Sec. 11. (1) The MIDC shall establish minimum standards,  
3 rules, and procedures to effectuate the following:

4       (a) The delivery of indigent ~~criminal~~-defense services must be  
5 independent of the judiciary but ensure that the judges of this  
6 state are permitted and encouraged to contribute information and  
7 advice concerning that delivery of indigent ~~criminal~~-defense  
8 services.

9       (b) If the caseload is sufficiently high, indigent ~~criminal~~  
10 defense services may consist of both an indigent ~~criminal~~-defender  
11 office and the active participation of other members of the state  
12 bar.

13       (c) ~~Trial courts~~ **A trial court** shall ~~assure~~ **ensure** that each  
14 criminal defendant is advised of ~~his or her~~ **the** right to counsel.  
15 ~~All adults, except those~~ **Youth may not waive the right to counsel**  
16 **without first consulting with counsel on the consequences of**  
17 **waiver. If a youth waives the right to counsel, it must be on the**  
18 **record and in writing.**

19       (d) **Except for a defendant** appearing with retained counsel or  
20 ~~those~~ **a defendant** who ~~have~~ **has** made an informed waiver of counsel,  
21 ~~must~~ **each defendant must, not later than the first appearance of**  
22 **the defendant in court,** be screened for ~~eligibility under this act,~~  
23 **indigency using the standards and procedures prescribed by MIDC**  
24 **under subsection (3),** and counsel must be assigned as soon as an  
25 indigent ~~adult~~ **defendant** is determined to be eligible for indigent  
26 ~~criminal~~-defense services.

27       (2) The MIDC shall implement minimum standards, rules, and  
28 procedures to guarantee the right of indigent defendants to the  
29 assistance of counsel as provided under ~~amendment~~ **Amendments VI and**

1 **XIV** of the Constitution of the United States and section 20 of  
2 article I of the state constitution of 1963. In establishing  
3 minimum standards, rules, and procedures, the MIDC shall adhere to  
4 the following principles:

5 (a) Defense counsel is provided sufficient time and a space  
6 where attorney-client confidentiality is safeguarded for meetings  
7 with defense counsel's client.

8 (b) Defense counsel's workload is controlled to permit  
9 effective representation. Economic disincentives or incentives that  
10 impair defense counsel's ability to provide effective  
11 representation must be avoided. The MIDC may develop workload  
12 controls to enhance defense counsel's ability to provide effective  
13 representation.

14 (c) Defense counsel's ability, training, and experience match  
15 the nature and complexity of the case to which ~~he or she~~ **the**  
16 **defense counsel** is appointed.

17 (d) The same defense counsel continuously represents and  
18 personally appears at every court appearance throughout the  
19 pendency of the case. However, indigent ~~criminal~~-defense systems  
20 may exempt ministerial, nonsubstantive tasks, and hearings from  
21 this prescription.

22 (e) Indigent ~~criminal~~-defense systems employ only defense  
23 counsel who have attended continuing legal education relevant to  
24 counsels' indigent defense clients.

25 (f) Indigent ~~criminal~~-defense systems systematically review  
26 defense counsel at the local level for efficiency and for effective  
27 representation according to MIDC standards.

28 ~~(3) The following requirements apply to the application for,~~  
29 ~~and appointment of, indigent criminal defense services under this~~

1 act:

2 ~~(a) A preliminary inquiry regarding, and the determination of,~~  
3 ~~the indigency of any defendant, including a determination regarding~~  
4 ~~whether a defendant is partially indigent, for purposes of this act~~  
5 ~~must be made as determined by the indigent criminal defense system~~  
6 ~~not later than at the defendant's first appearance in court. The~~  
7 ~~determination may be reviewed by the indigent criminal defense~~  
8 ~~system at any other stage of the proceedings. In determining~~  
9 ~~whether a defendant is entitled to the appointment of counsel, the~~  
10 ~~indigent criminal defense system shall consider whether the~~  
11 ~~defendant is indigent and the extent of his or her ability to pay.~~  
12 ~~Factors to be considered include, but are not limited to, income or~~  
13 ~~funds from employment or any other source, including personal~~  
14 ~~public assistance, to which the defendant is entitled, property~~  
15 ~~owned by the defendant or in which he or she has an economic~~  
16 ~~interest, outstanding obligations, the number and ages of the~~  
17 ~~defendant's dependents, employment and job training history, and~~  
18 ~~his or her level of education. A trial court may play a role in~~  
19 ~~this determination as part of any indigent criminal defense~~  
20 ~~system's compliance plan under the direction and supervision of the~~  
21 ~~supreme court, consistent with section 4 of article VI of the state~~  
22 ~~constitution of 1963. If an indigent criminal defense system~~  
23 ~~determines that a defendant is partially indigent, the indigent~~  
24 ~~criminal defense system shall determine the amount of money the~~  
25 ~~defendant must contribute to his or her defense. An indigent~~  
26 ~~criminal defense system's determination regarding the amount of~~  
27 ~~money a partially indigent defendant must contribute to his or her~~  
28 ~~defense is subject to judicial review. Nothing in this act prevents~~  
29 ~~a court from making a determination of indigency for any purpose~~

1 ~~consistent with article VI of the state constitution of 1963.~~

2 ~~(b) A defendant is considered to be indigent if he or she is~~  
3 ~~unable, without substantial financial hardship to himself or~~  
4 ~~herself or to his or her dependents, to obtain competent, qualified~~  
5 ~~legal representation on his or her own. Substantial financial~~  
6 ~~hardship is rebuttably presumed if the defendant receives personal~~  
7 ~~public assistance, including under the food assistance program,~~  
8 ~~temporary assistance for needy families, Medicaid, or disability~~  
9 ~~insurance, resides in public housing, or earns an income less than~~  
10 ~~140% of the federal poverty guideline. A defendant is also~~  
11 ~~rebuttably presumed to have a substantial financial hardship if he~~  
12 ~~or she is currently serving a sentence in a correctional~~  
13 ~~institution or is receiving residential treatment in a mental~~  
14 ~~health or substance abuse facility.~~

15 ~~(c) A defendant not falling below the presumptive thresholds~~  
16 ~~described in subdivision (b) must be subjected to a more rigorous~~  
17 ~~screening process to determine if his or her particular~~  
18 ~~circumstances, including the seriousness of the charges being~~  
19 ~~faced, his or her monthly expenses, and local private counsel rates~~  
20 ~~would result in a substantial hardship if he or she were required~~  
21 ~~to retain private counsel.~~

22 ~~(d) A determination that a defendant is partially indigent may~~  
23 ~~only be made if the indigent criminal defense system determines~~  
24 ~~that a defendant is not fully indigent. An indigent criminal~~  
25 ~~defense system that determines a defendant is not fully indigent~~  
26 ~~but may be partially indigent must utilize the screening process~~  
27 ~~under subdivision (c). The provisions of subdivision (c) apply to a~~  
28 ~~partially indigent defendant.~~

29 ~~(e) The MIDC shall promulgate objective standards for indigent~~

1 ~~criminal defense systems to determine whether a defendant is~~  
2 ~~indigent or partially indigent. These standards must include~~  
3 ~~availability of prompt judicial review, under the direction and~~  
4 ~~supervision of the supreme court, if the indigent criminal defense~~  
5 ~~system is making the determination regarding a defendant's~~  
6 ~~indigency or partial indigency.~~

7 ~~(f) The MIDC shall promulgate objective standards for indigent~~  
8 ~~criminal defense systems to determine the amount a partially~~  
9 ~~indigent defendant must contribute to his or her defense. The~~  
10 ~~standards must include availability of prompt judicial review,~~  
11 ~~under the direction and supervision of the supreme court, if the~~  
12 ~~indigent criminal defense system is making the determination~~  
13 ~~regarding how much a partially indigent defendant must contribute~~  
14 ~~to his or her defense.~~

15 ~~(g) A defendant is responsible for applying for indigent~~  
16 ~~defense counsel and for establishing his or her indigency and~~  
17 ~~eligibility for appointed counsel under this act. Any oral or~~  
18 ~~written statements made by the defendant in or for use in the~~  
19 ~~criminal proceeding and material to the issue of his or her~~  
20 ~~indigency must be made under oath or an equivalent affirmation.~~

21 **(3) The MIDC shall establish standards and procedures for**  
22 **determinations of indigency.**

23 (4) The MIDC shall establish standards for trainers and  
24 organizations conducting training that receive MIDC funds for  
25 training and education. The standards established under this  
26 subsection must require that the MIDC analyze the quality of the  
27 training, and must require that the effectiveness of the training  
28 be capable of ~~being measured and validated.~~ **measurement and**  
29 **validation.**

1           (5) An indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense system may include in its  
2 compliance plan a request that the MIDC serve as a clearinghouse  
3 for experts and investigators. If an indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense  
4 system makes a request under this subsection, the MIDC may develop  
5 and operate a system for determining the need and availability for  
6 an expert or investigator in individual cases.

7           Sec. 13. (1) All indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense systems and, at the  
8 direction of the supreme court, attorneys engaged in providing  
9 indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense services shall cooperate and participate  
10 with the MIDC in the investigation, audit, and review of their  
11 indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense services.

12           (2) An indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense system may submit ~~to the MIDC~~  
13 an estimate of the cost of developing the plan and cost analysis  
14 for implementing the plan under subsection (3) to the MIDC for  
15 approval. If approved, the MIDC shall award the indigent ~~eriminal~~  
16 defense system a grant to pay the approved costs for developing the  
17 plan and cost analysis under subsection (3).

18           (3) No later than 180 days after a standard is approved by the  
19 department, each indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense system shall submit a  
20 plan to the MIDC for the provision of indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense  
21 services in a manner as determined by the MIDC and shall submit an  
22 annual plan for the following state fiscal year on or before  
23 October 1 of each year. A plan submitted under this subsection must  
24 specifically address how the minimum standards established by the  
25 MIDC under this act will be met and must include a cost analysis  
26 for meeting those minimum standards. The standards to be addressed  
27 in the annual plan are those approved not less than 180 days before  
28 the annual plan submission date. The cost analysis must include a  
29 statement of the funds in excess of the local share, if any,

1 necessary to allow its system to comply with the MIDC's minimum  
2 standards.

3 (4) The MIDC shall approve or disapprove all or any portion of  
4 a plan or cost analysis, or both a plan and cost analysis,  
5 submitted under subsection (3), and shall do so ~~within~~**not later**  
6 **than** 90 calendar days ~~of~~**after** the submission of the plan and cost  
7 analysis. If the MIDC disapproves any part of the plan, the cost  
8 analysis, or both the plan and the cost analysis, the indigent  
9 ~~criminal~~ defense system shall consult with the MIDC and, for any  
10 disapproved portion, submit a new plan, a new cost analysis, or  
11 both ~~within~~**not later than** 60 calendar days ~~of~~**after** the mailing **or**  
12 **emailing** date of the official notification of the MIDC's  
13 disapproval. If, after 3 submissions, ~~a compromise is not reached,~~  
14 **the MIDC still disapproves of any portion of the plan or cost**  
15 **analysis,** the ~~dispute~~**disputed portion** must be resolved as provided  
16 in section 15. All approved provisions of an indigent ~~criminal~~  
17 defense system's plan and cost analysis must not be delayed by any  
18 disapproved portion and must proceed as provided in this act. The  
19 MIDC shall not approve a cost analysis or portion of a cost  
20 analysis unless it is reasonably and directly related to an  
21 indigent defense function.

22 (5) The MIDC shall submit a report to the governor, the senate  
23 majority leader, the speaker of the house of representatives, and  
24 the appropriations committees of the senate and house of  
25 representatives requesting the appropriation of funds necessary to  
26 implement compliance plans after all the systems compliance plans  
27 are approved by the MIDC. For standards approved after January 1,  
28 2018, the MIDC shall include a cost analysis for each minimum  
29 standard in the report and shall also provide a cost analysis for

1 each minimum standard approved on or before January 1, 2018, if a  
 2 cost analysis for each minimum standard approved was not provided,  
 3 and shall do so not later than October 31, 2018. The amount  
 4 requested under this subsection must be equal to the total amount  
 5 required to achieve full compliance as agreed upon by the MIDC and  
 6 the indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense systems under the approval process  
 7 provided in subsection (4). The information used to create this  
 8 report must be made available to the governor, the senate majority  
 9 leader, the speaker of the house of representatives, and the  
 10 appropriations committees of the senate and house of  
 11 representatives.

12 ~~(6) The MIDC shall submit a report to the governor, the senate~~  
 13 ~~majority leader, the speaker of the house of representatives, and~~  
 14 ~~the appropriations committees of the senate and house of~~  
 15 ~~representatives not later than October 31, 2021 that includes a~~  
 16 ~~recommendation regarding the appropriate level of local share,~~  
 17 ~~expressed in both total dollars and as a percentage of the total~~  
 18 ~~cost of compliance for each indigent criminal defense system.~~

19 ~~(6) (7)~~ Except as provided in subsection ~~(9)~~, **(8)**, an indigent  
 20 ~~eriminal~~-defense system shall maintain not less than its local  
 21 share. If the MIDC determines that funding in excess of the  
 22 indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense system's share is necessary in order to  
 23 bring its system into compliance with the minimum standards  
 24 established by the MIDC, that excess funding must be paid by this  
 25 state. The legislature shall appropriate to the MIDC the additional  
 26 funds necessary for ~~a~~ **an indigent defense** system to meet and  
 27 maintain those minimum standards, which must be provided to  
 28 indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense systems through grants as described in  
 29 subsection ~~(8)~~. ~~(7)~~. The legislature may appropriate funds that

1 apply to less than all of the minimum standards and may provide  
 2 less than the full amount of the funds requested under subsection  
 3 (5). Notwithstanding this subsection, it is the intent of the  
 4 legislature to fund all of the minimum standards contained in the  
 5 report under subsection (5) within 3 years of the date on which the  
 6 minimum standards were adopted.

7       **(7)** ~~(8)~~—An indigent ~~criminal~~ defense system must not be  
 8 required to provide funds in excess of its local share. The MIDC  
 9 shall provide grants to indigent ~~criminal~~ defense systems to assist  
 10 in bringing the systems into compliance with minimum standards  
 11 established by the MIDC.

12       **(8)** ~~(9)~~—An indigent ~~criminal~~ defense system is not required to  
 13 expend its local share if the minimum standards established by the  
 14 MIDC may be met for less than that share, but the local share of a  
 15 system that expends less than its local share under these  
 16 circumstances is not reduced by the lower expenditure.

17       **(9)** ~~(10)~~—This state shall appropriate funds to the MIDC for  
 18 grants to the local units of government for the reasonable costs  
 19 associated with data required to be collected under this act that  
 20 is over and above the local unit of government's data costs for  
 21 other purposes.

22       **(10)** ~~(11)~~—Within 180 days after receiving funds from the MIDC  
 23 under subsection ~~(8)~~, ~~(7)~~, an indigent ~~criminal~~ defense system  
 24 shall comply with the terms of the grant in bringing its system  
 25 into compliance with the minimum standards established by the MIDC  
 26 for effective assistance of counsel. The terms of a grant may allow  
 27 an indigent ~~criminal~~ defense system to exceed 180 days for  
 28 compliance with a specific item needed to meet minimum standards if  
 29 necessity is demonstrated in the indigent ~~criminal~~ defense system's

1 compliance plan. The MIDC has the authority to allow an indigent  
 2 ~~criminal~~-defense system to exceed 180 days for implementation of  
 3 items if an unforeseeable condition prohibits timely compliance.

4 (11) ~~(12)~~-If an indigent ~~criminal~~-defense system is awarded no  
 5 funds for implementation of its plan under this act, the MIDC shall  
 6 nevertheless issue to the **indigent defense** system a zero grant  
 7 reflecting that it will receive no grant funds.

8 (12) ~~(13)~~-The MIDC may apply for and obtain grants from any  
 9 source to carry out the purposes of this act. All funds received by  
 10 MIDC, from any source, are state funds and must be appropriated as  
 11 provided by law.

12 (13) ~~(14)~~-The MIDC shall ensure proper financial protocols in  
 13 administering and overseeing funds utilized by indigent ~~criminal~~  
 14 defense systems, including, but not limited to, all of the  
 15 following:

16 (a) Requiring documentation of expenditures.

17 (b) Requiring each indigent ~~criminal~~-defense system to hold  
 18 all grant funds in a fund that is separate from other funds held by  
 19 the indigent ~~criminal~~-defense system.

20 (c) Requiring each indigent ~~criminal~~-defense system to comply  
 21 with the standards promulgated by the ~~governmental-accounting~~  
 22 ~~standards board~~. **Governmental Accounting Standards Board.**

23 (14) ~~(15)~~-If an indigent ~~criminal~~-defense system does not  
 24 fully expend a grant toward its costs of compliance, its grant in  
 25 the second succeeding fiscal year must be reduced by the amount  
 26 equal to the unexpended funds. Identified unexpended grant funds  
 27 must be reported by indigent ~~criminal~~-defense systems on or before  
 28 October 31 of each year. Funds subject to extension under  
 29 subsection ~~(11)~~ **(10)** must be reported but not included in the

1 reductions described in this subsection. Any grant money that is  
2 determined to have been used for a purpose outside of the  
3 compliance plan must be repaid to the MIDC, or if not repaid, must  
4 be deducted from future grant amounts.

5       **(15)** ~~(16)~~—If an indigent ~~criminal~~ defense system expends funds  
6 in excess of its local share and the approved MIDC grant to meet  
7 unexpected needs in the provision of indigent ~~criminal~~ defense  
8 services, the MIDC shall recommend the inclusion of the funds in a  
9 subsequent year's grant if all expenditures were reasonably and  
10 directly related to indigent ~~criminal~~ defense functions.

11       **(16)** ~~(17)~~—The court shall collect contribution or  
12 reimbursement from individuals determined to be partially indigent  
13 under applicable court rules and statutes. Reimbursement under this  
14 subsection is subject to section 22 of chapter XV of the code of  
15 criminal procedure, 1927 PA 175, MCL 775.22. The court shall remit  
16 100% of the funds it collects under this subsection to the indigent  
17 ~~criminal~~ defense system in which the court is sitting. Twenty  
18 percent of the funds received under this subsection by an indigent  
19 ~~criminal~~ defense system must be remitted to the department in a  
20 manner prescribed by the department and reported to the MIDC by  
21 October 31 of each year. The funds received by the department under  
22 this subsection must be expended by the MIDC ~~in support of indigent~~  
23 ~~criminal defense systems in this state.~~ **to implement its minimum**  
24 **standards and to ensure that indigent defense systems comply with**  
25 **the minimum standards.** The remaining 80% of the funds collected  
26 under this subsection may be retained by the indigent ~~criminal~~  
27 defense system for purposes of reimbursing the costs of collecting  
28 the funds under this subsection and funding indigent defense in the  
29 subsequent fiscal year. The funds collected under this subsection

1 must not alter the calculation of the local share made ~~pursuant to~~  
 2 **under** section ~~3(i)-3~~.

3       Sec. 15. (1) Except as provided in section 5, if a dispute  
 4 arises between the MIDC and an indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense system  
 5 concerning the ~~requirements of this act, including a dispute~~  
 6 ~~concerning the approval of an indigent eriminal~~-defense system's  
 7 **annual** plan ~~, or cost analysis, or compliance with section 13 or~~  
 8 ~~17,~~ the parties shall attempt to resolve the dispute by mediation.  
 9 The state court administrator, as authorized by the supreme court,  
 10 shall appoint a mediator agreed to by the parties within 30  
 11 calendar days of the mailing **or emailing** date of the official  
 12 notification of the third disapproval by the MIDC under section  
 13 13(4) to mediate the dispute and shall facilitate the mediation  
 14 process. The MIDC shall immediately send the state court  
 15 administrative office a copy of the official notice of that third  
 16 disapproval. If the parties do not agree on the selection of the  
 17 mediator, the state court administrator, as authorized by the  
 18 supreme court, shall appoint a mediator of ~~his or her~~ **the state**  
 19 **court administrator's** choosing. Mediation must commence within 30  
 20 calendar days after the mediator is appointed and terminate within  
 21 60 calendar days of its commencement. Mediation costs associated  
 22 with mediation of the dispute must be paid equally by the parties.

23       **(2) The MIDC shall establish resolution procedures under**  
 24 **section 9(5) related to resolving a dispute with an indigent**  
 25 **defense system that is not in compliance with section 13 or 17.**  
 26 **These procedures must be available on a public website. If a**  
 27 **dispute between the MIDC and an indigent defense system concerning**  
 28 **compliance with section 13 or 17 cannot be resolved through the**  
 29 **MIDC resolution procedures created under this subsection,**

1 **subsection (4) applies.**

2 (3) ~~(2)~~—If the parties do not come to a resolution of the  
3 dispute during mediation under subsection (1), all of the following  
4 apply:

5 (a) The mediator may submit ~~his or her~~ **a** recommendation of how  
6 the dispute should be resolved to the MIDC within 30 calendar days  
7 of the conclusion of mediation for the MIDC's consideration.

8 (b) The MIDC shall consider the recommendation of the  
9 mediator, if any, and shall approve a final plan or ~~the~~ cost  
10 analysis, or both, in the manner the MIDC considers appropriate  
11 within 30 calendar days, and the indigent ~~criminal~~ defense system  
12 shall implement the plan as approved by the MIDC.

13 (c) The indigent ~~criminal~~ defense system that is aggrieved by  
14 the final plan, cost analysis, or both, may bring an action seeking  
15 equitable relief as described in subsection ~~(3)~~ **(4)**.

16 (4) ~~(3)~~—The MIDC ~~,~~ or an indigent ~~criminal~~ defense system may  
17 bring an action seeking equitable relief in the circuit court only  
18 as follows:

19 (a) Within 60 days after the MIDC's issuance of an approved  
20 plan and cost analysis under subsection ~~(2)(b)~~ **(3)(b)**.

21 (b) Within 60 days after the system receives grant funds under  
22 section ~~13(8)~~ **13(7)**, if the plan, cost analysis, or both, required  
23 a grant award for implementation of the plan.

24 (c) Within 30 days of the MIDC's determination that the  
25 indigent ~~criminal~~ defense system has breached its duty to comply  
26 with ~~an~~ **any of the following:**

27 (i) **An approved plan.**

28 (ii) **A cost analysis.**

29 (iii) **A grant contract provision.**

1           **(iv) A provision of section 13 or 17.**

2           (d) The action must be brought in the judicial circuit where  
3 the indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense ~~service~~-**system** is located. The state  
4 court administrator, as authorized by the supreme court, shall  
5 assign an active or retired judge from a judicial circuit other  
6 than the judicial circuit where the action was filed to hear the  
7 case. Costs associated with the assignment of the judge must be  
8 paid equally by the parties.

9           (e) The action must not challenge the validity, legality, or  
10 appropriateness of the minimum standards approved by the  
11 department.

12           **(5) ~~(4)~~**-If the dispute involves the indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense  
13 system's plan, cost analysis, or both, the court may approve,  
14 reject, or modify the submitted plan, cost analysis, or the terms  
15 of a grant awarded under section ~~13(8)~~-**13(7)** other than the amount  
16 of the grant, determine whether section 13 has been complied with,  
17 and issue any orders necessary to obtain compliance with this act.  
18 However, the system must not be required to expend more than its  
19 local share in complying with this act.

20           **(6) ~~(5)~~**-If a party refuses or fails to comply with a previous  
21 order of the court, the court may enforce the previous order  
22 through the court's enforcement remedies, including, but not  
23 limited to, its contempt powers, and may order that the state  
24 undertake the provision of indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense services in  
25 lieu of the indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense system.

26           **(7) ~~(6)~~**-If the court determines that an indigent ~~eriminal~~-  
27 defense system has breached its duty under section 17(1), the court  
28 may order the MIDC to provide indigent ~~eriminal~~-defense on behalf  
29 of that **indigent defense** system.

1           (8) ~~(7)~~—If the court orders the MIDC to provide indigent  
 2 ~~criminal~~—defense services on behalf of an indigent ~~criminal~~—defense  
 3 system, the court shall order the system to pay the following  
 4 amount of the state's costs that the MIDC determines are necessary  
 5 ~~in order to~~ bring the indigent ~~criminal~~—defense system into  
 6 compliance with the minimum standards established by the MIDC:

7           (a) In the first year, 20% of the state's costs.

8           (b) In the second year, 40% of the state's costs.

9           (c) In the third year, 60% of the state's costs.

10          (d) In the fourth year, 80% of the state's costs.

11          (e) In the fifth year, and any subsequent year, not more than  
 12 the dollar amount that was calculated under subdivision (d).

13           (9) ~~(8)~~—An indigent ~~criminal~~—defense system may resume  
 14 providing indigent ~~criminal~~—defense services at any time as  
 15 provided under section 13. When ~~a~~ **an indigent defense** system  
 16 resumes providing indigent ~~criminal~~—defense services, it is no  
 17 longer required to pay an assessment under subsection ~~(7)~~ **(8)** but  
 18 must be required to pay no less than its share.

19           Sec. 17. (1) Except as provided in subsection (2), every local  
 20 unit of government that is part of an indigent ~~criminal~~—defense  
 21 system shall comply with an approved plan under this act.

22           (2) ~~A~~ **An indigent defense** system's duty of compliance with 1  
 23 or more standards within the plan under subsection (1) is  
 24 contingent upon receipt of a grant in the amount sufficient to  
 25 cover that particular standard or standards contained in the plan  
 26 and cost analysis approved by the MIDC.

27           (3) The MIDC may proceed under section 15 if an indigent  
 28 ~~criminal~~—defense system breaches its duty of compliance under  
 29 subsection (1).

1           Sec. 21. Both of the following apply to the MIDC:

2           (a) ~~The~~ **Except as provided in section 7(17), the** freedom of  
3 information act, 1976 PA 442, MCL 15.231 to 15.246. ~~, except as~~  
4 ~~provided in section 7(10).~~

5           (b) The open meetings act, 1976 PA 267, MCL 15.261 to 15.275.

6           Sec. 23. (1) Nothing in this act shall be construed to  
7 overrule, expand, or extend, either directly or by analogy, any  
8 decisions reached by the United States ~~supreme court~~ **Supreme Court**  
9 or the supreme court of this state regarding the effective  
10 assistance of counsel.

11           (2) Nothing in this act shall be construed to override section  
12 29 or 30 of article IX of the state constitution of 1963.

13           (3) Except as otherwise provided in this act, the failure of  
14 an indigent ~~criminal~~ defense system to comply with statutory duties  
15 imposed under this act does not create a cause of action against  
16 the government or a system.

17           (4) ~~Statutory~~ **The** duties imposed **under this act** that create a  
18 higher standard than that imposed by the United States ~~constitution~~  
19 **Constitution** or the state constitution of 1963 do not create a  
20 cause of action against a local unit of government, an indigent  
21 ~~criminal~~ defense system, or this state.

22           (5) ~~Violations~~ **A violation of the** MIDC rules that ~~do~~ **does** not  
23 constitute ineffective assistance of counsel under the United  
24 States ~~constitution~~ **Constitution** or the state constitution of 1963  
25 ~~do~~ **does** not constitute grounds for a conviction to be reversed or a  
26 judgment to be modified for ineffective assistance of counsel.