Legislative Analysis



INGHAM COUNTY COURT CONSOLIDATION

Phone: (517) 373-8080 http://www.house.mi.gov/hfa

House Bill 6344 as enacted Public Act 666 of 2018 Sponsor: Rep. Sam Singh

http://www.legislature.mi.gov

Analysis available at

House Committee: Judiciary Senate Committee: Judiciary

Complete to 2-14-19

SUMMARY:

House Bill 6344 amends the Revised Judicature Act to allow for the consolidation of the 54-A District Court (Lansing), 54-B District Court (East Lansing), and 55th District Court (Ingham County except for Lansing and East Lansing).

Currently, the 54-A District Court consists of the city of Lansing, is a district of the third class, and has four judges. The 54-B District Court consists of the city of East Lansing, is a district of the third class, and has two judges. The 55th District Court consists of the county of Ingham (other than Lansing and East Lansing), is a district of the second class, and has two judges.

As defined in the Revised Judicature Act, a district of the first class consists of one or more counties. Each county in a district is responsible for maintaining, financing, and operating the district court within its respective county. A district of the second class consists of a group of political subdivisions (e.g., cities and/or townships) within a county. The county is responsible for maintaining, financing, and operating the district court. A district of the third class also consists of one or more political subdivisions within a county; however, each political subdivision composing the district is responsible for maintaining, financing, and operating the district court within its respective political subdivision.

Court consolidation approval

House Bill 6344 allows the governing bodies of Lansing, East Lansing, and Ingham County to approve by resolution the consolidation of their respective district courts into the 55th District Court. If the consolidation is approved by November 1, 2019, all of the following apply beginning March 1, 2020:

- The 54-A and 54-B District Courts are abolished.
- The 55th District Court consists of all of the territory of the current 54-A, 54-B, and 55th District Courts, is a district of the first class, and has eight judges.
- All full-time employees of the courts to be abolished must be transferred to the 55th District Court. Except as provided by the district control units (district funding units) of those courts in any agreement of consolidation, the salary, seniority rights, annual leave, sick leave, and retirement benefits of the transferred employees must be preserved and continued in their positions in the 55th District in a manner not inferior to their prior status.

House Fiscal Agency Page 1 of 3

• By proposing or authorizing the consolidation of the three district courts, the legislature is not creating a new obligation for any affected district control unit. (That is, the consolidation is not a state-mandated increase in the level of an activity or service under the Headlee Amendment.)

First eight years after the consolidation

If the consolidated district is created under the bill, all of the following apply until March 29, 2027 (eight years after the bill's effective date):

- The 55th District is divided into three election divisions, as follows:
 - The first division has four judges and consists of Lansing and Lansing Township.
 - o The second division has two judges and consists of East Lansing.
 - The third division has two judges and consists of Ingham County except for Lansing, Lansing Township, and East Lansing.
- Each incumbent district judge in the former district courts serves as a district judge in the consolidated district and is considered an incumbent in the election division in which he or she resides.

Beginning eight years after the consolidation

After March 29, 2027 (eight years after the bill's effective date), the three election divisions are abolished and the judges of the 55th District Court must be elected at large.

Jury pools

If the consolidated district is created, a jury trial in the 55th District Court conducted in connection with a criminal offense or any other cause of action must be conducted as follows:

- For a criminal offense or any other cause of action that occurred in Lansing or Lansing Township—before a jury of citizens who are residents of those two political subdivisions.
- For a criminal offense or any other cause of action that occurred in East Lansing—before a jury of citizens who are residents of East Lansing.
- For an offense or any other cause of action that occurred in Ingham County, but not in Lansing, East Lansing, or Lansing Township—before a jury of citizens who are residents of Ingham County but who do not live in Lansing, East Lansing, or Lansing Township.

MCL 600.8125

FISCAL IMPACT:

House Bill 6344 would have no fiscal impact on the state, but would likely result in a fiscal impact on the cities of Lansing and East Lansing and on Ingham County. If Lansing, East Lansing, and Ingham County approve resolutions to consolidate the current 54-A, 54-B, and 55th District Courts into a new 55th District Court, the intent would be for a net savings to occur, which would be achieved through attrition, as fewer staff would be needed to perform required tasks. Savings would not occur immediately, as full-time staff would be

retained under the bill. Not all staff leaving employment, post-consolidation, will be replaced. It is not possible to estimate the fiscal impact at this time because the actual terms of the final agreement are not known.

BRIEF DISCUSSION:

Under the bill, the local governmental units of Lansing, East Lansing, and Ingham County could adopt a resolution to consolidate the district courts located in each jurisdiction. Consolidating the three districts into a single district has been discussed on and off for almost two decades. A consolidation is believed to result in a cost savings to all three governmental units as well as improve court efficiency and services to residents. Consolidating districts of the third class into a county court of the first class is not a new concept, and the bill is modeled after other successful consolidations, notably in Kalamazoo. The bill accounts for the unique makeup of residents of East Lansing and Lansing by preserving the jury pools for those jurisdictions, even after the eventual elimination of the election divisions. Consolidation also could spur discussions on where to locate the district court or courts. Discussion and negotiations on location could lead to courts being moved where residents have easier access.

However, the 54-B District Court opposes the proposed consolidation, and a judge of the 54-A District Court submitted written testimony opposing it as well. Among the primary objections to consolidation are that it would change the demographic and racial makeup of jury pools (despite arguments to the contrary), and voters in judicial elections, in ways that would be detrimental to diversity both in the jury box and on the bench. (For example, African Americans represent 24% of the population of Lansing, but only 12% of the population of Ingham County as a whole.) The bill also raises other concerns. For instance, a portion of East Lansing is located in Clinton County, and a portion of Lansing in Eaton County. When the election divisions are abolished, it is not clear whether residents of East Lansing and Lansing who live outside Ingham County would be able to serve on juries or vote for judges under the bill, which in both cases appears to require Ingham County residency. Other concerns include giving discretion to local officials to decide whether to preserve current salary and benefit levels for the full-time employees transferred to the 55th District Court after the consolidation.

Legislative Analyst: Susan Stutzky Fiscal Analyst: Robin Risko

House Fiscal Agency HB 6344 as enacted Page 3 of 3

[■] This analysis was prepared by nonpartisan House Fiscal Agency staff for use by House members in their deliberations, and does not constitute an official statement of legislative intent.